The Behavior of Low Molecular Weight Organic Carbon-14 Containing Compounds in Contaminated Groundwater During Denitrification and Iron-Reduction

Aislinn A. Boylan, Douglas I. Stewart, James T. Graham & Ian T. Burke

To cite this article: Aislinn A. Boylan, Douglas I. Stewart, James T. Graham & Ian T. Burke (2020): The Behavior of Low Molecular Weight Organic Carbon-14 Containing Compounds in Contaminated Groundwater During Denitrification and Iron-Reduction, Geomicrobiology Journal

To link to this article: https://doi.org/10.1080/01490451.2020.1728442

Published online: 17 Feb 2020.
The Behavior of Low Molecular Weight Organic Carbon-14 Containing Compounds in Contaminated Groundwater During Denitrification and Iron-Reduction

Aislinn A. Boylan, Douglas I. Stewart, James T. Graham, and Ian T. Burke

School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK; School of Civil Engineering, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK; National Nuclear Laboratory, Sellafield, UK

ABSTRACT

Aqueous low molecular weight organic carbon-14 (14C) substances can be formed by the oxidation of carbide and impurities within nuclear fuel cladding. During reprocessing and interim storage 14C-labeled organic compounds may leak to the shallow subsurface environments at nuclear facilities where denitrifying and iron reducing zones can exist. 14C-labeled organic compounds (acetate, formate, formaldehyde and methanol) were used as electron donors in microcosm experiments, under both denitrification and iron reduction, using glacial outwash sediments and groundwater composition representative of the Sellafield nuclear reprocessing site, UK. In denitrifying microcosms, <6% of the initial 14C-DOC remained 15 days after injection into the microcosm irrespective of the electron donor; with concurrent 14CO2 (g) production. Lack of removal in sterile controls suggests that 14C-organics were metabolized by microorganisms. Under iron-reducing conditions both 14C-carboxylates were removed from solution rapidly, but some formaldehyde and methanol remained in solution 32 days after injection into the microcosm so there is potential that a proportion of 14C-formaldehyde and 14C-methanol may persist for longer in subsurface environments.

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 4 April 2019
Accepted 4 February 2020

KEYWORDS

Radiocarbon; contaminated land; groundwater; organic carbon; anaerobic microbial utilization

Introduction

Contamination of groundwater is common at nuclear sites where historic leaks of radionuclides to subsurface environments, including carbon-14 (14C), technetium-99 (99Tc), strontium-90 (90Sr) and uranium-238 (238U), are co-located with contaminants such as nitrate (from nitric acid) and organic acids. Such groundwater contamination has been recorded at nuclear licensed sites including Sellafield, UK (Law et al. 2010; McKenzie and Armstrong-Pope 2010; Thorpe et al. 2012), Oak Ridge, TN, USA (Edwards et al. 2007; Istok et al. 2004; McBeth et al. 2007), San Juan Shiprock, NM, USA (Finneran et al. 2002) and Hanford, WA, USA (Singleton et al. 2005). These sites are often typified by their high nitrate and in some cases significant naturally occurring iron(III) oxyhydroxide phases that create a variety of redox conditions in the subsurface including localized reducing zones and can exist at a wide range of pH, although circumneutral pH dominate at most sites (Begg et al. 2007; Edwards et al. 2007; Fredrickson et al. 2004; Istok et al. 2004; Law et al. 2010; McBeth et al. 2007; McKenzie and Armstrong-Pope 2010; Sellafield Ltd. 2016; Stamper et al. 2012).

Iron reducing conditions may also be deliberately engineered at nuclear sites by biostimulation (where an electron donor is added to groundwater to stimulate the indigenous microbial community and create a reducing environment; Lloyd and Renshaw 2005), as the radionuclides Tc and U can be reduced to their insoluble, low-valence forms under such geochemical conditions (Burke et al. 2006, 2010; Lloyd et al. 2000; Morris et al. 2008; Senko et al. 2005). Biostimulation enhances microbial respiration and therefore increases the production of HCO3– which may increase the pH and promote supersaturation of carbonate mineral phases including siderite and calcite (Monger et al. 1991, Parmar et al. 2000; Roden et al. 2002), both of which have the potential to incorporate inorganic 14C as 14CO32−.

14C is produced at each stage of the nuclear fuel cycle. It is of concern due to its long half-life of 5730 ± 40 a (Godwin 1962), its ability to bioaccumulate (Begg et al. 1992; Cooke et al. 1998; Yim and Caron 2006), and its position as a key radionuclide in safety assessment for geological disposal (NDA 2012). Inorganic 14C behavior in groundwater environments is influenced mainly by pH and the availability of divalent cations (Krauskopf and Bird 1995, Boylan et al. 2017). However, there is concern that 14C-labeled low molecular weight organic (LMWO) substances, which are predicted to form under geological disposal conditions (Wieland and Hummel 2015), may also form in intermediate waste storage facilities due to the corrosion of activated fuel and fuel cladding (Kaneko et al.
During interim storage at nuclear sites, such as within silos at the Sellafield nuclear reprocessing site, UK, reducing conditions may occur due to the lack of oxygen penetration with increasing depth (Kaneko et al. 2002; Wieland and Hummel 2015). Corrosion under completelyoxic or reducing conditions are expected to produce predominantly $^{14}$CO$_2$ and $^{14}$CH$_4$, respectively (Wieland et al. 2002; Wieland and Hummel 2015). During interim storage at nuclear sites, such as within silos at the Sellafield nuclear reprocessing site, UK, reducing conditions may occur due to the lack of oxygen penetration with increasing depth (Kaneko et al. 2002; Wieland and Hummel 2015). Corrosion under completely oxic or reducing conditions are expected to produce predominantly $^{14}$CO$_2$ and $^{14}$CH$_4$, respectively (Wieland et al. 2002; Wieland and Hummel 2015). Corrosion under completely oxic or reducing conditions are expected to produce predominantly $^{14}$CO$_2$ and $^{14}$CH$_4$, respectively (Wieland et al. 2002; Wieland and Hummel 2015).

These compounds can be utilized by microorganisms under reducing conditions (Daniel et al. 1999; Ferry 1990; Garrido et al. 2001; Lovley and Phillips 1988), and acetate consumption has been recorded at nuclear contaminated sites such as Rifle, CO, USA (Anderson et al. 2003) and Sellafield, UK (Newsome et al. 2014; Thorpe et al. 2012), however little work has been undertaken to elucidate the behavior of $^{14}$C-LMWOs.

Equations for the oxidation of these four LMWO substances are shown below under denitrifying conditions (Equations 1–12) and under iron reducing conditions (Equations 13–15). All of these reactions convert organic carbon in to inorganic forms.

Acetate

\[
\text{CH}_3\text{COO}^- + 4\text{NO}_3^- \rightarrow 4\text{NO}_2^- + \text{HCO}_3^- + \text{CO}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (1)
\]

\[
\text{CH}_3\text{COO}^- + 2\text{NO}_2^- \rightarrow \text{N}_2\text{O} + \text{HCO}_3^- + \text{CO}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (2)
\]

\[
\text{CH}_3\text{COO}^- + 4\text{N}_2\text{O} \rightarrow 4\text{N}_2 + \text{HCO}_3^- + \text{CO}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (3)
\]

Formate

\[
\text{HCOO}^- + \text{NO}_3^- \rightleftharpoons \text{NO}_2^- + \text{HCO}_3^- \quad (4)
\]

\[
\text{HCOO}^- + 2\text{NO}_2^- \rightleftharpoons \text{N}_2\text{O} + \text{HCO}_3^- \quad (5)
\]

\[
\text{HCOO}^- + \text{N}_2\text{O} \rightleftharpoons \text{N}_2 + \text{CO}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (6)
\]

Formaldehyde

\[
\text{CH}_2\text{O} + 2\text{NO}_3^- \rightleftharpoons 2\text{NO}_2^- + \text{CO}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (7)
\]

\[
\text{CH}_2\text{O} + 2\text{NO}_2^- \rightleftharpoons \text{N}_2\text{O} + \text{CO}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (8)
\]

\[
\text{CH}_2\text{O} + \text{N}_2\text{O} \rightleftharpoons \text{N}_2 + \text{CO}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (9)
\]

Methanol

\[
\text{CH}_3\text{OH} + 3\text{NO}_3^- \rightleftharpoons 3\text{NO}_2^- + \text{CO}_2 + 2\text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (10)
\]

\[
\text{CH}_3\text{OH} + 2\text{NO}_2^- \rightleftharpoons \text{N}_2\text{O} + \text{CO}_2 + 2\text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (11)
\]

\[
\text{CH}_3\text{OH} + 2\text{N}_2\text{O} \rightleftharpoons 2\text{N}_2 + \text{CO}_2 + 2\text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (12)
\]

Acetate

\[
\text{CH}_3\text{COO}^- + 8\text{FeOOH} + 15\text{H}^+ \rightleftharpoons 8\text{Fe}^{2+} + 2\text{HCO}_3^- + 12\text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (13)
\]

Formate

\[
\text{HCOO}^- + \text{FeOOH} + \text{H}^+ \rightleftharpoons \text{Fe}^{2+} + \text{HCO}_3^- + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (14)
\]

Formaldehyde

\[
\text{CH}_2\text{O} + 4\text{FeOOH} + 8\text{H}^+ \rightleftharpoons 4\text{Fe}^{2+} + \text{CO}_2 + 7\text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (15)
\]

Methanol

\[
\text{CH}_3\text{OH} + 8\text{FeOOH} + 18\text{H}^+ \rightleftharpoons 8\text{Fe}^{2+} + \text{CO}_2 + 15\text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (16)
\]

This study aims to address the behavior of $^{14}$C-labeled LMWOs in near-field reducing groundwater environments at the circumneutral pH which dominates many nuclear contaminated sites, for example Sellafield site, UK, where pH is most commonly reported between 6 and 7 (Sellafield Ltd. 2016).

The specific objectives of this study were: (1) to investigate the behavior of four $^{14}$C-LMWO substances (acetate, formate, formaldehyde and methanol) in circumneutral aqueous environments in contact with sediment under denitrification and iron-reducing conditions; (2) to establish the extent of transformation of organic $^{14}$C to $^{14}$CO$_2$(g) and to quantify the amount of $^{14}$C retained in the organic and inorganic fractions in solids; (3) to determine any changes to the active microbial population after incubation with the organic compounds under denitrifying or iron-reducing conditions; and (4) to assess the implications of these processes for the fate $^{14}$C in dissolved organic carbon (DOC) in the shallow subsurface environments.

Materials and methods

Sediment

Near surface sediment was collected from the bank of the River Calder, Cumbria, UK (Lat 54°26.3′N, Long 3°28.2′W) in July 2016. This sediment is representative of the glacial/fluvial quaternary deposits underlying the UK Sellafield nuclear reprocessing site (Law et al. 2010; Wallace et al. 2012). Sediment was collected in sterile HDPE bags and stored at 4°C. Prior to use the soil was sieved and the <2mm fraction retained for use.

Bioreduction microcosms

Sediment microcosms were prepared with 10 ± 0.1 g of wet sediment mixed with 100 ± 1 mL of a synthetic groundwater media representative of groundwater in the region around Sellafield (Wilkins et al. 2007) in sterile 120 mL glass serum bottles (Wheaton Scientific, U.S.). Two artificial groundwater compositions were used, (A) unamended (used for iron-reducing conditions) and (B) high nitrate, which was amended with sodium nitrate to produce a final nitrate concentration of 10 mM L$^{-1}$ (used for denitrifying conditions) (Table 1). Groundwater was filtered (0.2 μm), sparged with N$_2$(g) and pH adjusted after deoxygenation prior to addition to microcosm. The microcosm headspaces were sparged with N$_2$(g) before sealing with butyl rubber septa and...
crams. Experiments were run in triplicate with the exception of sterilized control microcosms which were single experiments.

After the microcosms were established, they were incubated in the dark to allow the desired redox conditions to develop (7 days for denitrifying microcosms and 28 days for iron-reducing microcosms). After incubation the desired LMWO (acetate, formate, formaldehyde or methanol) was spiked into the microcosms through the butyl rubber septa. The spike consisted of the non-labeled LMWO at a final concentration of $10^{-5}$ M and 14C-labeled LMWO at a final concentration of $5 \times 10^{-2}$ M (producing a final 14C activity of 100 Bq ml$^{-1}$ in each bottle). Formate and acetate were added as a sodium salt, and acetate was C2 labeled (methyl group) (ARC Ltd., USA). After the initial incubation period, the sterile control microcosms were autoclaved for 30 minutes at 120°C prior to spiking with 14C compounds.

**Geochemical methods**

Fe(II) in the solid fraction was determined using an acid extraction based on the method of Lovley and Phillips (1986) whereby the amount of Fe(II) in the solid is expressed as a percentage of the total 0.5 M HCl extractable Fe present in the sediment. Approximately 0.1 g of sediment was added to 5 mL of 0.5 M HCl and left for 60 minutes, followed by colorimetric assay for Fe(II) and total Fe using the ferrozine method (Viollier et al. 2000: lowed by colorimetric assay for Fe(II) and total Fe using the perillidine method (Lovley and Phillips 1986) whereby the amount of Fe(II) in the solid is developed (7 days for denitrifying microcosms and 28 days for iron-reducing microcosms). After incubation the desired LMWO (acetate, formate, formaldehyde or methanol) was spiked into the microcosms through the butyl rubber septa. The spike consisted of the non-labeled LMWO at a final concentration of $10^{-5}$ M and 14C-labeled LMWO at a final concentration of $5 \times 10^{-2}$ M (producing a final 14C activity of 100 Bq ml$^{-1}$ in each bottle). Formate and acetate were added as a sodium salt, and acetate was C2 labeled (methyl group) (ARC Ltd., USA). After the initial incubation period, the sterile control microcosms were autoclaved for 30 minutes at 120°C prior to spiking with 14C compounds.

### Table 1. Solution composition for unamended synthetic groundwater and high nitrate synthetic groundwater, modified from Wilkins et al. (2007).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compound</th>
<th>g/L in DIW</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KCl</td>
<td>0.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MgSO4·7H2O</td>
<td>0.0976</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MgCl2·6H2O</td>
<td>0.081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NaCl</td>
<td>0.0094</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*NaNO3</td>
<td>0.868</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*NaNO3 only added to high nitrate solution composition.

14C associated with sediment

Inorganic and organic 14C associated with sediment (TIC and TOC) were measured in a two-step process where the sediment is first acidified and then oxidized, and the CO2 gas evolved in each step is captured by Carbo-Sorb E, mixed with PermaFluor E and quantified by liquid scintillation counter (procedure adapted from Magnusson et al. 2008, full method in Supporting information, Section S1). This method is 85–95% efficient at recovering 14C (as measured by Magnusson et al. 2008).

**Microbiology**

Eleven soil samples were selected for next-generation sequencing; one from each system (four organic compounds under two different redox conditions) and three unamended samples (sediment collected at the field site and frozen on the same day). DNA was extracted from soil samples (~0.5 g) using the Fast DNA spin kit for soil (MP Bio). DNA fragments in the size range 3 kb to ~20 kb were isolated on a 1% agarose ‘1x’ Tris-borate-EDTA (TBE) gel stained with ethidium bromide for viewing under UV light (10x TBE solution supplied by Invitrogen Ltd., UK). The DNA was extracted from the gel using a QIAquick gel extraction kit (QIAGEN Ltd, UK); final elution was by 1/10th strength elution buffer (unless explicitly stated, the manufacturer’s protocols supplied with all kits employed were followed precisely). DNA concentration was quantified fluorometrically using a Qubit dsDNA HS Assay (Thermo Fisher Scientific Inc., USA).

DNA samples (1 ng/µL in 20 µL aqueous solution) were sent for sequencing at the Center for Genomic Research, University of Liverpool, where Illumina TruSeq adapters and indices were attached to DNA fragments in a two-step PCR amplification targeting the V4 hyper-variable region of the 16S rRNA gene. Pooled amplicons were paired-end sequenced on the Illumina MiSeq platform (2 x 250 bp). Illumina adapter sequences were removed, and the trimmed reads were processed using the UPARSE pipeline (Edgar 2013) within the USEARCH software (version 9.2) on a Linux platform. Operational taxonomic units (OTUs) were defined by minimum of 97% sequence identity between the putative OTU members. OTUs were assigned to taxonomic groups using the online Ribosomal Database Project (Wang et al. 2007), using a confidence value of 0.7 to give a reasonable tradeoff between sensitivity and error rate in the taxonomy prediction.
Statistical analysis was performed to determine the bacterial diversity. In this study the alpha diversity was defined using Hill numbers, \( D_q \) (Hill 1973; Jost 2006). Hill numbers define the biodiversity as the reciprocal mean of proportional abundance and compensate for the disproportionate impact of rare taxa by weighting taxa based on abundance. The degree of weighting is controlled by the index \( q \) where increasing \( q \) places progressively more weight on the high-abundance species in a population (Hill 1973; Jost 2006, 2007; Kang et al. 2016). \( D_0 \) is the unweighted Hill number and is equal to the species richness. \( D_1 \) is a measure of the number of common species and is equivalent to the exponential of Shannon entropy. \( D_2 \) is a measure of the number of dominant species and is equivalent to the inverse of Simpson concentration (Hill 1973; Jost 2006, 2007).

Results

Sediment characterization

Sediment from the Calder Valley has been extensively characterized in previous studies (e.g., Law et al. 2010; Wallace et al. 2012). Briefly, the sediment is a poorly sorted sandy loam, with the fine fraction dominated by quartz, albite, microcline, chlorite and mica (see previous study by Boylan et al. 2018 for XRD spectra). The approximate particle composition was 53% sand, 42% silt and 5% clay with an average TOC of 0.56 ± 0.08 wt. % (Law et al. 2010), sediment pH was 5.5.

Microcosm geochemical conditions

Geochemical conditions in the microcosms were measured within one hour of establishment (see Table 2) prior to any amendment (i.e., nitrate addition) to establish pH and concentration of iron and nitrate/nitrite at the start of incubation.

The behavior of \(^{14}\)C-labeled LMWO compounds under denitrifying conditions

For all denitrification experiments the nitrate was added on day 0, and the microcosms were then incubated for a week to allow denitrifying conditions to develop prior to spiking with the \(^{14}\)C-LMWO substances on day 7. In the acetate experiments the percentage of aqueous \(^{14}\)C-DOC decreased from 100% on day 7 to 2% at the 8 day sample point (i.e., 98% acetate was removed from solution within 24 hrs; see Figure 1(a)). It then remained at 3 ± 2% for the duration of the experiment (14 days). The percentage of \(^{14}\)C-DOC in solution in the formate experiment decreased from 100% on day 7 to 1% at the 8 day sample point, and remained at 3 ± 2% for the duration of the experiment (14 days). The concentration of \(^{14}\)C-formaldehyde reduced to 6% by day 14 and remained there until the end of the experiment (day 22). In the methanol experiments the percentage of \(^{14}\)C-DOC in solution decreased from 100% on day 7 to 30% by day 14, with 6% remaining in solution at the end of the experiment (on day 22) (see Supporting information, Figure S1 for complete data set, 7 to 22 days).

All pH values remained circumneutral throughout the duration of the experiments ranging from a maximum value of pH 7 to a minimum of pH 5.5 (days 7–22; Figure 1(b)). In all experiments nitrate concentrations measured on day 7 were 1 ± 0.4 mM, and over the duration of the experiment all concentrations reduced to 0.5 ± 0.3 mM. Nitrite concentrations measured at the addition of LMWO were between 2.1 and 2.6 mM for all experiments. All showed an increase in nitrite concentration between 48 and 72 hours after LMWO addition with concentrations of 3.3; 3.0; 2.6; and 2.2 mM for acetate, formate, formaldehyde and methanol respectively. At the final sample point all nitrite concentrations had decreased (2.3; 2.0; 2.2; 1.5 mM respectively).

The amount of Fe(II) in solid fraction remained below 12% for all electron donors for the duration of the experiments with no increasing/decreasing trend in concentration recorded in the experiments. Aqueous \( Fe^{2+} \) measurements were <0.35 \( \mu \)M and so below limit of detection for all experiments.

In the control experiments the pH for the acetate experiments was 5.1 on day 7, increasing to 5.8 at the end of the experiment (day 14). For all other electron donors the pH remained relatively constant at 5.6 ± 0.2 after inoculation with the LMWO (day 7–14). The percentage of \(^{14}\)C in solution remained at 99 ± 1% throughout the experiment for each electron donor. The amount of Fe(II) in solid fraction remained below 10% for each electron donor and the amount of Fe in solution was below the limit of detection. The amount of nitrate in solution was measured at 2.2 ± 0.3 mM for all electron donors and the amount of nitrite remained almost constant at 0.5 mM after inoculation with the LMWO (see Supporting information Figure S3).

\(^{14}\)C speciation at the end of denitrification experiments

The distribution of \(^{14}\)C between the organic aqueous fraction, inorganic and organic solid fractions (TIC and TOC) and \( CO_2(g) \) in the headspace at the end of the microcosm experiments is reported in Table 3. There was measurable \(^{14}\)CO\(_2(g)\) in the headspace of all the experiments, with the lowest value of 25.7% of the initial \(^{14}\)C spike in the acetate experiment and the maximum recovery at 72.5% of the initial \(^{14}\)C spike from the methanol experiment. Very little \(^{14}\)C from any of the LMWOs is retained in any solid phase (TIC or TOC) under denitrifying conditions (highest retention was observed with formaldehyde where 7.3 ± 5.2% of the

Table 2. Geochemical conditions measured in unaltered microcosms within one hour of establishment.

| Geochemical conditions prior to amendments | 5.1–6.6 |
| pH | 5.1–6.6 |
| Fe(II) (as % of total Fe in solid) | 0.5 ± 0.5% |
| Fe\(^{2+}\) in solution (\( \mu \)M) | <0.35 \( \mu \)M* |
| Nitrate (mM) | 0.8 ± 0.01 |
| Nitrite (mM) | 0.08 ± 0.01 |

*LOD: Limit of detection (0.35 \( \mu \)M).
The behavior of $^{14}$C-labeled LMWO compounds under iron-reducing conditions

The iron reducing microcosms were initially incubated for 28 days to permit iron reducing conditions to develop. The $^{14}$C-LMWO substance was then added on day 28, and the active phase ran from day 28 to either day 35 (acetate and formate) or day 60 (formaldehyde and methanol). The nitrate and nitrite concentrations prior to the incubation were 0.8 ± 0.08 mM and 0.08 ± 0.01, respectively. At this point 0.5% of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase was Fe(II), and the concentration of Fe in solution was below the limit of detection (0.35 mM) (see Table 2).

In the acetate experiments the percentage of the initial $^{14}$C-LMWO spike that remained in solution decreased from 100% on day 28 to 5% on day 35 (Figure 2(a)). In the formate experiments the decrease was from 100% on day 28 to 3% on day 35. In the formaldehyde experiment the decrease was from 100% on day 28 to 75% on day 35, and finally to 11% on day 60. Similarly, in the methanol experiment the decrease was more gradual from 100% on day 28 to 19% on day 60 (see Supporting information, Figure S2 for complete data set).

The pH of all experiments remained between pH 6.9 and pH 5.5 for the duration of the experiments. In the acetate experiment 9.4% of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase was Fe(II) on day 28 and by the end of the experiment (day 35) 14.5% of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase was Fe(II). The formate experiment exhibited a slightly greater increase in the proportion of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase (it increased from 7.6% on day 28 to 20% on day 35). The formaldehyde and methanol experiments exhibited similar patterns to the acetate and formate experiments, but the greater test durations meant that 32.7% and 29% of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase that was Fe(II) by day 60 (Figure 2(c)).

The pH of all experiments remained between pH 6.9 and pH 5.5 for the duration of the experiments. In the acetate experiment 9.4% of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase was Fe(II) on day 28 and by the end of the experiment (day 35) 14.5% of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase was Fe(II). The formate experiment exhibited a slightly greater increase in the proportion of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase (it increased from 7.6% on day 28 to 20% on day 35). The formaldehyde and methanol experiments exhibited similar patterns to the acetate and formate experiments, but the greater test durations meant that 32.7% and 29% of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase that was Fe(II) by day 60 (Figure 2(c)).

On day 28 aqueous Fe$^{2+}$ was measured in all the active microcosms (1.0, 1.0, 0.7 and 0.4 μM, in the acetate, formate, formaldehyde and methanol systems, respectively). It varied slightly between day 28 and the end of each test without clear patterns but was always between 0.4 and 1.5 μM (Figure 2(d)). Nitrate concentrations remained below 0.2 mM in every system throughout the duration of the experiments.
experiment, nitrite concentrations were all below 0.1 mM for the duration of the experiment.

In the control experiments the pH for all the systems remained relatively constant at 5.6 ± 0.2 for the duration (day 28–35). The percentage of the 14C LMWO in solution remained at 100 ± 2% throughout the experiment in all four systems. At the point of 14C LMWO addition (day 28) between 13 and 20% of the acid extractable iron in the solid phase was Fe(II), and the aqueous Fe concentration was between 0.84 and 1.9 μM. The nitrate concentration was <0.06 mM in all the controls and the nitrite concentration was 0.02 mM (see Supporting information, Figure S4).

14C speciation at the end of the iron-reducing experiments

The distribution of 14C between the organic aqueous fraction, inorganic and organic solid fractions and the CO2(g) in the headspace at the end of the iron-reducing microcosm experiments is reported in Table 4. In all the experiments 44.6% to 64.9% of the 14C spike was converted to CO2(g) in the headspace. Only a small proportion of 14C from any of the LMWOs is retained in any solid phase under iron-reducing conditions (highest retention was observed with methanol where about 10% of the original 14C activity was recovered from both the inorganic and organic fractions).

Microbial community composition

Illumina MiSeq analysis gave >100,000 paired-end reads per sample after quality control. The eleven samples of this study were part of a combined pool of 8,763,897 million paired-end reads which passed the chimera check and these were clustered in to OTUs (>97% sequence identity) in the UPARSE pipeline and assigned to taxonomic groups. OTUs classified as archaea (8% of non-chimeric reads) and bacteria which were not classified at phylum level with a confidence of >0.7 (41% of non-chimeric reads) were excluded from further analysis. This resulted in 7073 OTUs in the eleven samples which were classified to bacteria phylum with a confidence greater than 0.7 which were used to characterize the impact of 14C-labeled electron donors on microbial populations under varying redox conditions.

Taken together the samples contained bacteria from 11 phyla that individually represented more than 1% of the total population (the 'major' phyla). The unaltered sediment
samples contained between 10 and 11 individually identified phyla at more than 1% of the total population. Acidobacteria was the most abundant phylum (28 ±2% of the reads), followed by Proteobacteria (27 ±2%), Actinobacteria (10 ±3%) and Verrucomicrobia (10 ±3%; Figure 3). This microbial community composition was similar to those described in previous studies using sediment collected from the same site (Geissler et al. 2011; Thorpe et al. 2012).

Under nitrate reducing conditions for acetate, formate and formaldehyde the number of major phyla was 10. Acidobacteria is the most abundant phylum (28–35%). The relative abundance of Proteobacteria was between 29 and 30%, with the largest relative contribution from the Betaproteobacteria class (11–13%). In the methanol sample the number of major phyla was reduced to 7, 35% of OTUs were associated with the Betaproteobacteria class, with the order of Burkholderiales accounting for 92% of the reads. 98% of the Gammaproteobacteria were associated with the Xanthomondales order and particularly the Rhodanobacter genus (see Figure 3; Supporting information Table S1).

The number of major phyla represented under iron reducing conditions was 9 for the acetate and formate systems. The most abundant phylum was Proteobacteria (39 ±1%), Acidobacteria (24%) and Actinobacteria (13 ±1%). The number of phyla represented in the formaldehyde system was 8. The most abundant of which was Proteobacteria (61%), followed by Acidobacteria (11%) and Actinobacteria (9%). In the methanol system there were 9 major phyla. The most abundant of these was Proteobacteria (52%), followed by Acidobacteria (19%) and Planctomycetes (5%) (see Figure 3).

The OTU richness (D0a) for each sample is shown below in Table 5. The average richness for the unaltered sediment was 5790 OTUs, but this decreases by between 31% and 44% under both reducing conditions. On average there are 75% fewer common species under reducing conditions than in the unaltered sediment (D1a for the unaltered sediment was 922 ±336 OTUs, whereas it was between 105 and 360 OTUs under the reducing conditions). Similarly there were 75% fewer dominant species (D2a for unaltered sediment is 218 ±114, whereas it was between 17.9 and 68.8 under reducing conditions). As common and dominant OTUs accounted for more than 78% and 48% of total sequence reads in all the samples, the decrease in the number of common and dominant OTUs in the reducing systems represented a shift toward fewer, but more abundant OTUs under these conditions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unaltered sediment</th>
<th>Denitrification</th>
<th>Iron reduction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time after addition of LMWO</td>
<td>Total incubation time</td>
<td>7d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D0a</td>
<td>5640</td>
<td>6590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D1a</td>
<td>495</td>
<td>1320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D2a</td>
<td>80.8</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion

**The behavior of aqueous $^{14}$C-LMWO substances during denitrification**

After the period of incubation it is assumed that the concentration of organic matter remaining in the unaltered sediment would be minimal, consequently at the point of addition of the LMWOs they would act as the primary source of electron donor in each system. In the acetate and formate microcosms LMWO removal from solution occurred concurrently with nitrate reduction (Figure 1), and resulted in $^{14}$CO$_2$ accumulation in the microcosm headspace. As removal was not observed in the sterile systems, it was most likely a microbial process. Oxidation of non-fermentable organic substrates, such as acetate, formate, formaldehyde and methane (metabolism) by organotrophic bacteria must be coupled to the reduction of an electron acceptor which was most probably nitrate. Formaldehyde and methanol were removed from solution less rapidly than acetate and formate, and their removal continued after the nitrate concentration stabilized during a period when the nitrite concentrations decrease. This suggests their removal may have been coupled to nitrite reduction as well as nitrate reduction. The concentration of nitrate at the point of LMWO addition varies from 1.3 and 0.64 mM for the four systems, this was probably due to different rates of nitrate reduction occurring in each microcosm, however the removal of $^{14}$C-LMWOs in each system suggests that denitrification continued and the variation in concentration did not affect the utilization of the various LMWO compounds. At phylum level, the microbial populations of the denitrification experiments using acetate, formate and formaldehyde were similar to those of the unaltered sediment, with ~30% of OTUs belonging to the Proteobacteria, this corresponds with previous work under oxic conditions where no changes were identified when LMWOs were added at 10 μM concentration (Boylan et al. 2018). Only the denitrification experiments using methanol exhibited a significant change in the bacterial population. The number of major phyla in this sample reduced from 11 in unaltered sediment to 7, with the Proteobacteria dominating the community. More than half of the total reads were from the Betaproteobacteria (35%) and Gammaproteobacteria (30%) classes of Proteobacteria. The increase in the Gammaproteobacteria was principally due to an increase in sequences from the Xanthomonadales order, and specifically the genus Rhodanobacter (this genus contains facultative anaerobes capable of denitrification; Prakash et al. 2012). It was present in all the samples from the denitrification system, but was much increased in the methanol sample and has been identified at other nuclear contaminated sites as having an important role in denitrification (e.g., Oak Ridge, TN, USA, Green et al. 2012). The increase in the number of Betaproteobacteria was principally due to an increase in sequences from the order Burkholderiales which contains many methylotrophic representatives (i.e., species that can reduce compounds containing a single carbon; Kalyuzhnaya et al. 2008).

The behavior of aqueous $^{14}$C-LMWO substances under iron reducing conditions

The percentage of Fe(II) in the solid fraction was increasing prior to injection of the LMWO (when the LMWO on day 28 was injected Fe(II) was 5 to 10 times the level found in the unaltered microcosms), and both the nitrate and nitrite concentrations were very low throughout the duration of the experiments, which together indicate that iron-reducing processes were established prior to addition of $^{14}$C-labeled electron donors in these tests. At the end of all experiments more than 44% of $^{14}$C was recovered as $^{14}$CO$_2$(g), whereas no $^{14}$C-DOC removal from solution was observed in control experiments (see Supporting information Figures S3–S4), suggesting microbial utilization is occurring in all systems, however the rate of $^{14}$C removal varied between the LMWOs. The carboxylates (acetate and formate) were rapidly removed from solution with around 5% remaining on day 35, whereas more than 10% of the $^{14}$C-formaldehyde and $^{14}$C-methanol remained in solution on day 60. This suggests that the $^{14}$C-formaldehyde and $^{14}$C-methanol are most likely to be mobile in subsurface environments under iron-reducing conditions relative to denitrifying conditions.

Although all measured $^{14}$C concentrations in solid fraction are low, there was a slightly higher percentage of $^{14}$C-TOC under iron reducing conditions compared to denitrification. In the TIC fraction 5% of the total $^{14}$C was retained in both the formate and methanol systems, possibly in carbonates such as siderite which can precipitate under microbially induced iron-reducing conditions; Thorpe et al. 2012; Wieland and Hummel 2015. A simple PHREEQC calculation suggests that siderite can be supersaturated under iron reducing conditions at pH > 6.7 if there is sufficient Fe(II) and carbonate (see Supporting information, S5), therefore siderite precipitation was possible in the methanol system as the pH reached 6.9. Some $^{14}$C was also retained in the TOC fraction for all electron donors, which suggests retention either through sorption reactions or assimilation.

Under iron-reducing conditions the phylogenetic composition of the microbial community was different to that of the unaltered sediment with all samples showing an increase in the relative abundance of Betaproteobacteria class ($7.2 \pm 1.5\%$ for unaltered compared with $27.3 \pm 6.6\%$ for iron-reducing). All systems showed an increase in the proportion of reads associated with the order Burkholderiales which includes species able to utilize both single C organic compounds and those containing C-C bonds (Chistoserdova et al. 2009; Kalyuzhnaya et al. 2008). The largest increase was associated with the formaldehyde sample where more than 34% of total reads belong to this order. There was a decrease in the number of dominant OTU’s (as represented by the $D_2^r$ value) between the electron donors (acetate > formate > formaldehyde > methanol), but an increase in the proportion of reads assigned to these OTUs, from a minimum of 48% for acetate to 73% for methanol. This indicates a shift toward bacterial populations with a smaller number of more abundant OTUs as the electron donor becomes more reduced and suggests that acetate and formate can be used by a wider range of bacteria than...
formaldehyde or methanol. A similar pattern is seen replicated in the denitrifying experiments, although to a lesser degree (minimum of 48% for acetate to a maximum of 65% for methanol).

**Implications for persistence of $^{14}$C-containing LMWO compounds in anaerobic subsurface environments**

$^{14}$C-labeled carboxylates (acetate and formate) do not persist in aqueous form under denitrification and iron-reducing conditions in sediment which has an active microbial population as a rapid transformation from organic to inorganic $^{14}$C occurs. The rate of $^{14}$C-formaldehyde and $^{14}$C-methanol oxidation under both denitrification and iron reducing conditions was slower than for the acetate and formate which may suggest that fewer microbes are adapted to use these substrates (this is supported by the lower diversity values). Retention of $^{14}$C by inorganic and organic solids was minimal across all electron donors and redox conditions (<6% of original activity) suggesting that in subsurface environments there will be little retention in the solid fraction at circumneutral pH. However both the inorganic and organic solid phase association will be affected by changes in groundwater pH (Boylan et al. 2017; Gu and Schulz 1991; Krauskopf and Bird 1995; Sposito 1989) with the potential to increase the $^{14}$C retention. These results imply that aqueous $^{14}$C will be most persistent in groundwater as $^{14}$C-containing alcohol and aldehyde compounds under iron reducing conditions, but as even these compounds are slowly utilized, $^{14}$C-LMWOs are unlikely to persist in shallow sub-surface environments in the long term.

**Conclusions**

This study shows that across most redox and electron donor systems $^{13}$C-LMWO substances are removed rapidly from solution. The production of inorganic $^{14}$C is attributed to microbial utilization of the $^{14}$C-LMWO substances, which in subsurface environments would increase the $^{14}$C associated with the dissolved inorganic pool. The retention in solid phase is minimal in both organic and inorganic phases reaching a maximum of ~5% of total $^{14}$C activity with sorption of the organic species limited at circumneutral pH values as the anion exchange capacity is restricted (Gu and Schulz 1991; Sposito 1989). The indigenous microbial population in this study represent a diverse mix of phyla which are ubiquitous in terrestrial environments and are likely to be similar to those found in the shallow subsurface of nuclear sites, e.g., Sellafield reprocessing site, UK. They are able to utilize $^{14}$C-labeled carboxylate electron donors (acetate and formate) rapidly under reducing conditions, formaldehyde and methanol are both utilized quickly under denitrification conditions, but under iron-reducing conditions both $^{14}$C-formaldehyde and $^{14}$C-methanol may persist for longer in subsurface environments and be transported with groundwater flow.

**Acknowledgements**

We thank Fiona Keay, Andy Bray and Andrea Vidal Dura (all University of Leeds) for help with AAS analysis and bioinformatics respectively. We also thank the Center for Genomic Research, University of Liverpool for sequencing. This research was funded by an Industrial CASE doctoral training award to AAB [grant number EP/K504440/1] made by the UK Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council with additional funding from National Nuclear Laboratory Ltd and Sellafield Ltd.

**Disclosure statement**

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).

**ORCID**

Aislinn A. Boylan http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2490-8446
James T. Graham http://orcid.org/0000-0001-7510-2894

**References**


